Workforce & Organizational Research Center THE RESURRECTION PROJECT Building Relationships. Creating Healthy Communities.

# Improving Recruitment & Reducing Turnover in Illinois' Immigrant-Serving Organizations

September 2023



### **About the Report**

The Resurrection Project (TRP) engaged the Workforce & Organizational Research Center (WORC) to investigate causes of turnover and identify employee retention best practices at 51 partner organizations in the statewide network of immigrant legal service providers in Illinois.

### **About WORC**

Headquartered in Evanston, IL and launched in March 2021 by a cohesive team of academic researchers, the Workforce & Organizational Research Center (WORC) is a woman-owned social enterprise offering decades of experience with rigorous evaluation and research along with clear, incisive storytelling of results. WORC envisions an economy where every worker has a job worth having. WORC's team has extensive expertise in issues related to economic, social, and political inequality and justice and the systems change required to create a more equitable society. We have conducted program evaluations and academic research across a wide range of fields, including workforce development, social services, immigrant legal aid, health care, early childhood education, manufacturing, TDL (transportation, distribution, and logistics), retail, and hospitality.

## **About The Resurrection Project**

The Resurrection Project (TRP) builds trusting relationships to educate and propel individuals, immigrants, and families to achieve their social and economic aspirations, stable homes, and equitable participation in their community. TRP is a leading provider of affordable housing, financial education, and immigration services on Chicago's Southwest side.

For more than three decades TRP, has worked to improve the lives of individuals and families by creating wealth, building assets, and engaging residents to be catalysts for change. Rooted in the Pilsen community, TRP's impact now extends across the City of Chicago and through the State of Illinois; we are making steady progress towards leveraging and preserving more than \$1 billion in community wealth by 2025.

TRP conducts programming with the needs of and challenges faced by immigrants at the forefront. Under the Immigrant Justice Department, TRP provides high-quality legal consultations and representation through its legal clinic; leadership development opportunities and advocacy through its community navigator program; pass-through funding, serving as the administrator of the Chicago Legal Protection Fund Community Navigator program that supports 11 community-based organizations across the city and co-administers Illinois Access to Justice, a program that funds 50 immigrant-serving organizations across; and provides training and capacity building through its Immigrant Justice Leadership Academy, whose first initiative – the Colibrí Fellowship for DOJ Accreditation - launched Fall 2022.

### Acknowledgments

WORC would like to thank TRP for their endless support during data collection and data analysis and for serving as a valuable partner in making this study possible. WORC would also like to acknowledge all the executive directors who shared their time and valuable insights during interviews and employees who responded to the survey.

### Contents

Executive Summary	4
Research Design	5
Findings	5
Recruitment	6
Attorney Recruitment	6
Other Legal Professional and Community Advocate Recruitment	8
Retention	10
Attorney Turnover and Retention	10
Other Legal Professionals and Community Advocate Turnover and Retention	15
Salary Analysis	
Potential Strategies	27
Recruitment Practices	
Retention Practices	29
Transforming Funding Practices	29
Funding Strategies	
Appendices	31

## **Executive Summary**

The immigrant legal services field plays a critical role in US society and yet is persistently underfunded and facing staff recruitment and retention challenges. The work of supporting immigrants in this country is complex and emotionally demanding. Wages are generally low. Finding multilingual legal representatives and advocates is a challenge and degrees of cultural competency vary widely. Further, funding sources often include restrictions that impede the ability of agencies to improve job quality and, thus, retention and recruitment.

United by the goal of transforming jobs in immigrant services across the state of Illinois into viable, long-term careers for legal services staff and community navigator programs, WORC and TRP partnered to identify root causes of turnover and recruitment challenges and to uplift successful organizational practices that address these issues across the 50 immigrant-serving organizations in the Illinois Access to Justice network.

In order to access multiple perspectives on retention and recruitment challenges and best practices, WORC conducted a mixed-methods investigation that included in-depth interviews with executive directors (EDs) and anonymous surveys of agency staff.

Results were synthesized across data sources and indicate an encouraging level of agreement on both the causes of and potential solutions for recruitment and retention challenges among EDs, legal services staff members, and community advocates.

Survey and interview findings reveal that EDs and staff identify the following as key factors in retention and recruitment:

1. **Mission Alignment** - When staff members feel a strong sense of alignment with the organizational mission, they are more likely to remain in their roles; identifying candidates whose values align with the mission appears to be a useful strategy in recruiting staff who are likely to stay at the agency.

2. **Workplace Culture** – Both staff and EDs identified creating a positive workplace culture as a key lever in facilitating the recruitment and retention of staff members.

3, **Low Pay** - Although results suggest wages were not the top consideration for staff when accepting or remaining in their roles, low pay played a role in recruitment and retention challenges.

4. **Stressful Nature of the Work** – The risk of burnout, the normative practices of staff having to wear many professional hats, and the emotionally distressing nature of the work all contributed to recruitment and retention challenges.

This level of alignment between leadership and frontline staff is unusual in organizational research and demonstrates that many EDs have found ways to effectively listen to their staff members. Furthermore, some root causes and potential solutions that emerged relate to organizational practices (e.g., culture development) and are within the sphere of influence of EDs. As a result, EDs are uniquely positioned to drive retention and recruitment improvements for their staff, even without additional financial resources.

To retain staff at immigrant-serving organizations across Illinois, funders and nonprofit agencies should unite to address the main causes of turnover to create more sustainable long-term careers. Suggestions to make these careers more sustainable include:

- Critically examining funding structures and implementing modifications that support reducing workloads and the number of cases assigned to staff members
- Planning for professional development and career path opportunities for staff in budget cycles
- Providing adequate funding to support competitive wages and benefits, as well as merit increases
- Implementing organizational practices that may mitigate burnout among staff members





## **Research Design**

To understand perspectives on recruitment and retention challenges, current approaches to job design, and best practices, WORC used a mixed-methods approach to data collection. Perspectives on recruitment and retention were gleaned from immigrant legal aid attorneys who assist with citizenship, family petitions, adjustments of status, DACA renewals, U-Visas, removal defense and other related services as well as other legal professionals and community advocates including executive directors (EDs), receptionists/intake specialists/legal admin assistants, paralegals/legal assistants, DOJ accredited representatives, coordinators, managers, community navigator coordinators, community navigator managers, and organizers.

Twenty-eight EDs from 50 of TRP's immigrant-serving partner agencies within the Illinois Access to Justice network responded to an email inquiry in February 2022 detailing their willingness to change organizational practices to reduce turnover and improve recruitment. The results of these email responses were used to develop a survey instrument meant to investigate EDs' perceptions of challenges in recruitment and retaining staff, elevate best practices, identify systemic problems, and identify solutions to share with stakeholders. Semi-structured interviews were then conducted with 13 executive directors and 5 former immigrant-serving nonprofit employees between July and October 2022. These interviews ranged from 45-90 minutes and were coded by 5 analysts. Interview findings informed development of a final survey to capture employee perspectives on the job characteristics that entice them to stay with their current organizations and those that are likely to prompt them to look for employment elsewhere. The employee survey was sent to 241 staff members; the response rate exceeded 50%.

In addition to the survey and qualitative interviews, de-identified salary data from the latest fiscal year budgets (FY24, July 1, 2023 – June 30, 2024) of TRP's 50 immigrant-serving partner agencies was compiled to conduct a salary analysis. Salary information was collected by organization and position, and subsequently grouped into various job categories. An analyst ran calculations for the minimum, median, and maximum salaries by job category, organizational budget, and geographic region.

## Findings

Overall, executive directors and staff agree that mission alignment and agency culture are top reasons staff accept and remain in their positions. Additionally, competitive pay and manageable workloads ranked highly as factors related to turnover. When discussing challenges, EDs consistently pointed to funding practices as the single most important driver behind their agencies' inability to offer competitive pay and manageable workloads. EDs noted that receiving grants that provide general operating funds that will enable them to increase salaries and provide staff with raises, reach adequate overall staffing levels, and offer professional development opportunities may help improve retention and assuage burnout among staff.

When discussing recruitment, participants agreed that promoting jobs within the community and professional networking were the best ways to recruit for all positions. With respect to recruiting attorneys, building pipelines with law schools and universities was viewed as a promising strategy.





### Recruitment

### **ATTORNEY RECRUITMENT**

Attorneys and executive directors both reported that lawyers are ultimately drawn to agencies because they are aligned with the mission and appreciate the workplace culture. Networking was commonly reported by both lawyers and executive directors as effective strategies to recruit attorneys. Additionally, building pipelines by connecting with students through law schools and internships appeared to be a useful approach to recruiting.

### **Community & Networking**

Using their professional and community networks was reported by executive directors and attorneys as one of the best ways to recruit lawyers. Seven of 29 lawyers reported that they heard about their current role from someone in their professional network who saw the job posting and told them about it. Another 5 of 29 reported that someone other than the executive director at the agency had reached out to them about the role.

Lawyers indicate that building pipelines from universities was an effective way to recruit for these roles. Ten of 29 lawyers reported that posting jobs at law schools is the best way to recruit other lawyers.

Relationship-building was also an important recruitment tactic and 8 of 29 lawyers reported that asking interns to apply for an open position at the agency before they take the bar exam is a good way to recruit attorneys. Another 13 of 29 lawyers reported that offering internships that can lead to job opportunities is a great way to recruit lawyers.

"I'm hoping next fiscal year I'll have interns – that would make a lot more sense for hiring an attorney. Second or third year students. Even college students...." – **Executive Director** 

[Agency staff members] all shared [the job posting] with our own networks. The directing attorney knows quite a few attorneys herself. So, then she tried to also send the information. I also created [online job posting] accounts in different colleges and universities, particularly in law programs." – **Executive Director** 

#### **Social Media**

Executive directors and lawyers reported the importance of using social media and online job posting to recruit attorneys, with 6 of 29 lawyers reporting that they heard about their job on LinkedIn and another 4 of 29 reporting that they heard about the position on Indeed. Attorneys responded that the best way to recruit other lawyers was a job posting on Indeed (16 of 29 respondents), a job posting on LinkedIn (8 of 29 respondents), and a job posting on social media (7 of 29 respondents).

#### Waiving Job Requirements

Executive directors and lawyers also discussed waiving job requirements as a good way to recruit lawyers since there is a limited pool of qualified candidates, especially bilingual candidates. Ten of 29 lawyers indicated that waiving particular job requirements was one of the best ways to recruit other lawyers.





"We've hired some [candidates] pending bar exam results rather than people who have already passed the bar. We've tried to loosen any requirement that we could."

- Executive Director

#### **Mission Alignment**

Findings suggest that attorneys are often drawn to the work and agency based on personal traits, such as aligning with the mission and fitting into the agency culture. Mission alignment was a driver for lawyers to accept their positions with 96.5% of lawyers reporting that finding the work meaningful was an important reason for them to accept their current role – 79.3% rated it "very important." Additionally, 75.9% of attorneys reported that they accepted their current position because they wanted to practice immigration law in a non-profit environment – 62.1% rated it "very important." Further, fitting into the culture was also commonly mentioned by both executive directors and attorneys as reason that lawyers choose to work at an agency. Lawyers reported that both the agency staff seeming friendly/supportive (75.9%) and the supervisor seeming friendly/supportive (82.7%) were important reasons for them to accept their current role.

Neither executive directors nor lawyers reported that it is common for to lawyers accept positions due to a shortage of jobs, meaning that lawyers are choosing to work at these agencies for other reasons. In fact, 55.2% of lawyers reported that a limited availability of jobs was not at all an important reason for them to accept their current job.

### Most Important Considerations Among Attorneys In Accepting Current Position







### OTHER LEGAL PROFESSIONALS AND COMMUNITY ADVOCATE RECRUITMENT

Staff are often drawn to their roles because of their mission alignment, appreciation for the agency's workplace culture, and interest in professional development. Executive directors and staff reported that using community and professional networks was the best way to recruit staff. Further, many staff members were initially recruited into their current roles via other staff members' networks and direct outreach. Leveraging existing staff networks was the most recommended recruiting strategy.

#### **Community & Networking**

Relationship-building, promoting open positions within the community, and networking were reported by both executive directors and staff as the best ways to recruit staff. Both groups indicated these approaches were how many staff members were recruited into their current roles. Of staff surveyed, 9 of 94 reported hearing about their current role from someone in their professional network who told them about the job posting. Another 21 of 94 reported that someone other than the executive director at the agency told them about it, and 16 of 94 reported that the executive director of the agency contacted them directly. Finally, 23 of 94 indicated they heard about their current role while working at the agency in another role. Growing volunteers into staff members also emerged as a recommended practice with 16 of 94 staff reporting that they heard about their current role while volunteering at the agency.

Staff and executive directors agree on methods for recruiting into open roles with 44 of 94 staff recommending to use of the community network to spread the word about a job and another 20 of 94 staff noting that flyers and asking clients to discuss open positions are good methods for recruitment.

#### **Mission Alignment**

Personal characteristics of staff were an important factor when recruiting new staff members. Mission alignment, finding the work meaningful (95.7%), and the desire to give back to their community (92.6%) were all important characteristics reported by staff in accepting their current positions.

The value of professional growth opportunities was commonly reported among staff and executive directors with 87.2% of staff reporting that learning new skills was an important reason for them to accept their current position. Executive directors emphasized hiring staff to grow into DOJ positions as a successful recruitment strategy. "After I saw the job posting, I realized I knew someone from undergrad who was already working there. So, I talked to her." **- Former Employee** 

"I was actually recruited by the executive director, who contacted me and asked me to apply." - Former Employee





"What we've provided that's unique for our paralegals is opportunities for professional career advancement in the U.S. We care about your connection to your community and we can train you on immigration law."

- Executive Director

Executive directors and staff agreed that culture fit is an important recruitment strategy with staff reporting that both the agency staff seeming friendly/supportive (81.9%) and the supervisor seeming friendly/ supportive (88.3%) were important reasons for them to accept their current role.

#### **Social Media**

Many executive directors and staff recommended social media, particularly Indeed (56% of staff) and LinkedIn (60% of staff), as a recruitment strategy yet only 6 out of 94 staff heard about their current role through these resources. This disconnect demonstrates an opportunity for agencies to reassess their recruitment lead generation sources and streamline recruitment efforts.







## Retention

### **ATTORNEY TURNOVER AND RETENTION**

Executive directors and lawyers both reported that heavy workloads – often the result of the internal structures of agencies and funding levels – can lead to burnout and ultimately turnover among lawyers. The need for higher pay was commonly reported by both executive directors and lawyers as a necessary action to retain lawyers. Executive directors often cited funding as a barrier to offering lawyers competitive wages. Lawyers and executive directors also agreed that mission alignment and fitting into the work culture often keep lawyers at their agency.

### Most Important Considerations Among Attorneys In Continuing To Work At Current Agency



51.7%

can take time off when I need/want to



l can rely on my upervisor for help when I need it



44.8%

nave mentors within the agency



believe the agency s committed to my professional growth







23	<b>#1</b> The pay is too low	
17	<b>#2</b> The work is emotionally exhausting	
13	<b>#3</b> My caseload is too large	
11	#4 I do not receive the administrative support needed to do my job	
11	#4 There is little or no opportunity for advancement here	<b>Fop 5 Reasons</b>
9	<b>#5</b> The benefits are not sufficient	Attorneys
9	<b>#5</b> My work life and outside life are often in conflict	would Leave
6	<b>#6</b> I don't like the organizational culture	<b>Their Agency</b>
6	<b>#6</b> My supervisor has unrealistic expectations of me	
6	<b>#6 I do not receive enough legal support to do my job</b>	N = 29
5	<b>#7</b> I worry about my job security	
2	#8 I would prefer to work with more lawyers that I could collaborate with	
1_	<b>#9</b> Other: Limited work from home	

### % Of Attorneys Surveyed Who Somewhat Or Completely Agree With The Following Statements

N = 29







"I think the biggest [retention factors are] higher salaries and creating continuous learning opportunities"

#### - Former Employee

"Having better pay that matches inflation and promotions received is the biggest thing. Other positions similar to mine at other agencies are paying \$5-10k more than my current salary." - **Current Employee** 

#### **Internal Structures at the Agencies**

Executive directors and lawyers reported similar views about the organizational structures that can either facilitate retention or lead to turnover. Burnout, which can often lead to turnover, emerged as a major theme among the executive director interviews. EDs and attorneys indicated that the "wearing of too many hats" and large workloads were factors in turnover with 11 of 29 attorney-respondents indicating that structuring jobs so that one person can do them would help to better retain staff. Importantly, 13 of 29 lawyers reported that their caseload is too large to manage. Lawyers and executive directors also agreed that there is a lack of administrative assistance for staff to complete their jobs with 11 of 29 lawyers stating that the lack of administrative assistance would cause them to leave their agency.

#### Attorney survey responses:

- "I wear too many hats at work" (20.7% completely agree, 27.7% somewhat agree)
- **"I have too little time to mentor junior immigration practitioners"** (20.7% completely agree, 24.1% somewhat agree)

Professional development and advancement also emerged as factors that may explain turnover, with both executive directors and lawyers agreeing on the importance of professional development. Eighty-six percent of lawyers reported that their agency is committed to their professional growth, which would keep them at the agency. However, 10 of 29 lawyers responded that there is little or no opportunity for advancement at their agency.

### *"I feel isolated in my current position with a heavy caseload and 0 mentorship opportunities."* - **Current Employee**

"Opportunities are very important in a legal non-profit organization. These opportunities may be better explained, explored and developed by maximizing a supervisors ability to recognize each individuals strengths and weaknesses, not only colleagues but those that make up the legal staff such as legal assistants and paralegals, etc."

#### - Current Employee





#### **Pay/Benefits**

Executive directors and attorneys both reported that pay was a major barrier to retaining lawyers. Executive directors cited funding as a barrier to offer competitive wages to lawyers, who can generally find better pay in the private sector. 23 of 29 attorneys reported that low pay is the number one reason that they would leave their agency and 26 of 29 lawyers reported that increasing pay would help them remain at their agency.

Interestingly, attorneys indicated that benefits packages were important for retention, but at a lower rate than salaries. Nearly 83% of lawyers reported that their benefits package being acceptable to them would keep them at their agency, while 10 of 29 lawyers reported that increasing benefits would keep them at their agency. Executive directors did not mention benefits as a retention facilitator as commonly as lawyers did.

"We did have a few people who went and took positions at other places because they got an offer which was higher paying or had more benefits or was less challenging." - **Executive Director** 

#### **Emotionally Exhausting Nature of the Work and Burnout**

Lawyers and executive directors both reported that the nature of working with immigrant populations in legal crisis can be difficult and presents challenges for retaining staff. Executive directors frequently cited burnout as one of the main drivers of turnover, specifically identifying vicarious trauma and the nature of working with people in grave distress. Among lawyers, 17 of 29 reported that the work is emotionally exhausting. Additionally, reporting requirements from funders can also result in excessive workloads for lawyers that can lead to burnout.

Attorney survey responses:

- **"I'm emotionally drained at the end of the day due to the nature of the work"** (34.5% completely agree, 44.8% somewhat agree)
- "I'm physically exhausted at the end of the day because of the nature of the work" (20.7% completely agree, 37.9% somewhat agree)

*"I would like to receive more training on how I can improve my work and also on how to ensure that cases do not affect my emotional health." – Current Employee* 





#### Workplace Culture

Executive directors and attorneys both reported the importance of organizational culture to retaining staff. Executive directors emphasized the importance of a supportive and communicative environment and 82.7% of lawyers reported that enjoying the people that they work with and being able to rely on their supervisor for help when they need it would keep them at their agency.

A number of employees provided additional insights into support and boundaries needed from their supervisors:

- Setting clear goals, expectations, and instructions
- Maintaining professional boundaries across staff
- Providing direct communication and reasoning behind decisions being made at the management level

#### **Mission Alignment**

A retention facilitator that was reported by both executive directors and lawyers was the importance of mission alignment and dedication to the work. Specifically, 89.6% of lawyers reported that the main reason they would remain with their agency is because the work that they do is important. Executive directors' observations were similar.

"[The attorney] comes from immigrant parents. She witnessed a lot of the struggles herself growing up. So, I think that she can easily relate and has genuine passion that she wants to give back. She wants to serve the people that she feels closely with. We've had several conversations about the cons of the position, right. Salary, the benefits and such, but at the end of the day, she's been very open and honest with us about that she wants to work with people that actually need the help and not work at a private law firm." – **Executive Director** 

26	<b>#1</b> Increase pay
11	<b>#2</b> Structure my job so that one person can do it
10	<b>#3</b> Increase benefits
7	#4 Give more flexibility with work schedules
6	<b>#5</b> Explain career paths/opportunities to me
4	<b>#6</b> Provide more job security for my role
3	<b>#7</b> Increase educational opportunities
3	<b>#7</b> Promote people from within
6	#8 Other:
	Dedicated paralegal (1)
	Help mitigate turnover (1)
	Increase pto (1)
	Allow for more team decision making on case load (1)
	Increase pay (1)
	Completely restructure the organization (1)

N = 29





**Top 3 Things** 

Agencies Could Do

**To Ensure** 

**Attorneys** 

**Continue** To

**Work There** 

## OTHER LEGAL PROFESSIONALS AND COMMUNITY ADVOCATE TURNOVER AND RETENTION

Staff reported dedication to the work, mission alignment, and workplace culture as the top reasons they remain in their roles. Organizational structures such as the presence of career pathways and professional development opportunities were identified as factors for agencies to leverage in retaining staff. When discussing key drivers of turnover, staff and executive directors agreed that pay and benefits, burnout, and the emotionally exhausting nature of the work are reasons staff members may leave their roles.

"Good pay, benefits, and having a pathway to advance in the role are definitely important. And then having a supported and reasonable workload at the organization." - Former Employee

"Finding people who are doing it as a calling is really what retention is about and then compensating them, paying them, investing in them, making the environment the right place." - **Executive Director** 

### Most Important Considerations For Other Legal Professionals And Community Advocates In Continuing To Work At Current Agency



#### **Internal Structures at the Agencies**

Staff and executive directors reported that advancement opportunities and skill development are organizational structures that may facilitate retention with 76.6% of staff reporting advancement opportunities and 88.3% reporting learning new skills would keep them at their agency. 34 of the 94 staff and many executive directors agreed that improved communication of career paths and internal opportunities would help retain staff and that a lack of growth opportunities ultimately drives turnover at their agencies.

Organizational structures that leave staff overwhelmed and burnt-out drive turnover, with 42 of 94 staff reporting that caseloads being too large would cause them to leave their agency.





"There's a pipeline in our organization between intake specialists, to paralegal, to DOJ rep. Our paralegals usually were promoted from intake specialists." - **Executive Director** 

"There's a track for attorneys to supervisor positions, but there's no clear path for paralegals to move up in the organization." - **Former Employee** 

#### **Pay/Benefits**

Pay emerged as an important theme among staff with 81 of 94 staff respondents indicating that increasing pay would improve retention and 76 of 94 staff identifying low pay as the number one reason to leave their agency. Though executive directors understand the importance of pay, they discussed funding as a barrier to offering competitive wages, which sits outside of their sphere of control.

Sufficient benefits were an important factor in remaining at their agencies for 47 of 94 staff but did not emerge as a priority in interviews with executive directors, highlighting a variation in perceptions of causes of turnover between staff and executive directors.

"[The staff member] was offered a position at a private law firm making \$23 an hour and asked if we could increase from \$20 to \$23. Luckily, we had some operational grants that we were able to use." - **Executive Director** 

*"Everyone seems pretty happy. If I want to keep low turnover, I have to increase salaries, though, because I've noticed they're going up." – Executive Director* 

#### **Emotionally Exhausting Nature of the Work and Burnout**

Staff and executive directors agree that industry characteristics are important factors driving turnover with 47 of 94 staff reporting that the emotionally exhausting nature of the work is a major reason they would leave their agency. Executive directors frequently cited burnout, the difficult nature of the work, and vicarious trauma as main drivers of turnover. EDs also noted that some of the burnout experienced by staff is related to grant requirements. For example, some grants require specific quantities of cases to be closed in order for full funding to be awarded. As a result, complex cases that may persist for years drain resources and agencies must continually open new cases in order to keep grant funding flowing, adding to workloads in an unsustainable way.

"We've received a lot of requests for asylum. It can be very difficult and emotionally draining. So, when you're not getting compensated properly and you're exposed to all this vicarious trauma, it doesn't seem like it's a win-win [for the employee anymore]." - **Executive Director** 

"I would say [the team] has a generally high level of anxiety, workplace stress, and exposure to a lot of traumatic situations and secondhand trauma through the kinds of work that they do." - **Executive Director** 





#### **Workplace Culture**

Workplace culture, such as connections with coworkers and work-life balance, was an important retention facilitator with 86.1% of staff reporting that enjoying the people they work with would keep them at their agency. Executive directors and staff also indicated that work-life balance and PTO flexibility are important aspects of work culture with 80.8% of staff reporting that the ability to take time off as needed would keep them at their agency. This finding presents a unique opportunity for executive directors to drive retention by shaping an organizational culture around these characteristics.

*"We had to pull [a staff member] away and say, 'Take some time off outside of your vacation, just take a few days to recuperate." - Executive Director* 

*"I think people stayed..., because people were really good friends with their coworkers and many have stayed really close after the job." – Former Employee* 

#### **Mission Alignment**

Executive directors and staff indicated the importance of mission alignment and dedication to work with 97.9% of staff agreeing that the work they do is important and a driving factor in staying with their agency.

Student loan forgiveness did not emerge as a retention facilitator among staff and executive directors with 61.7% of staff reporting that this was not at all important, demonstrating that there are other levers to pull in retaining staff outside of loan forgiveness.

"[Mission-aligned staff] fall in love with doing the work and love clients, and then they feel guilty about leaving." - **Executive Director** 

<b>#1</b> The pay is too low	76
<b>#2</b> The work is emotionally exhausting	47
<b>#2</b> The benefits are not sufficient	47
<b>#3</b> There is little or no opportunity for advancement here	42
#4 My caseload is too large	41
<b>#5</b> My work life and outside life are often in conflict	35
#6 I worry about my job security	28
<b>#7</b> I do not have mentors at work	20
<b>#8</b> My supervisor has unrealistic expectations of me	19
<b>#9</b> I don't like the organizational culture	15



THE RESURRECTION PROJECT

Building Relationships. Creating Healthy Communities.

**Top 5 Reasons** 

**Other Legal** 

Community

**Would Leave** 

**Their Agency** 

**Advocates** 

And

N = 94

Professionals

17

#	<b>#1</b> Increase pay	81
<b>#2</b> Increase educational	nal opportunities	45
<b>#3</b> Explain career paths/oppor	portunities to me	34
<b>#4</b> Inc	ncrease benefits	29
<b>#5</b> Cive more flexibility with w	work schedules	24
<b>#5</b> Promote peop	ople from within	24
<b>#6</b> Provide more job secu	curity for my role	16
<b>#7</b> Structure my job so that one po	person can do it	13
	<b>#8</b> Other:	4
Commit more to equity in and reduce adminis		
Provide an assistant who receive pay to war	eives appropriate /ant to remain (1)	
Support to dea	eal with stress (1)	
Help me refind	nd my purpose (1)	
#6 Provide more job secur 7 Structure my job so that one po Commit more to equity in and reduce adminis Provide an assistant who receive pay to war Support to dea	curity for my role person can do it #8 Other: in the workplace histrative work (1) eives appropriate vant to remain (1) eal with stress (1)	16 13

Top 3 ThingsAgenciesCould DoTo EnsureOther LegalProfessionalsAndCommunityAdvocatesContinue ToWork There

N = 94







### **Comparison of Attorneys and Other Legal Professionals and Community Advocates**

There were many commonalities in findings across all roles in the agencies. For example, staff in all positions, including attorneys, indicated they are drawn to the work at their agencies because they are aligned with the mission and appreciate the workplace culture. These factors also play a role in their decisions to stay with their agencies. In another example, staff in all roles indicated that using community and professional networks was the best way to recruit for all positions.

### **Retention and Turnover**

Торіс	Attorneys	Other Legal Professionals and Community Advocates
Most important reasons people stay with their agencies	<ul> <li>√ Mission alignment and dedication to work</li> <li>√ Work culture and coworkers</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>√ Mission alignment and dedication to work</li> <li>√ Work culture and coworkers</li> <li>√ Professional development and career paths</li> </ul>
Most important reasons people leave their agencies	<ul> <li>√ Pay &amp; benefits</li> <li>√ Burnout and workload</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>√ Pay &amp; benefits</li> <li>√ Burnout and workload</li> <li>√ Lack of advancement opportunities</li> </ul>

### Recruitment

Торіс	Attorneys	Other Legal Professionals and Community Advocates
Best channels	<ul> <li>√ Word of mouth</li> <li>√ Law schools and interns as pipelines</li> </ul>	√ Community & networking
Least useful channels	√ Social media	√ Social media
Top reasons for accepting job	<ul> <li>✓ Mission alignment and dedication to the work</li> <li>✓ Fitting into the work culture</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>√ Mission alignment and dedication to the work</li> <li>√ Fitting into the work culture</li> </ul>





## **Salary Analysis**

### Summary

Findings from this research show that pay is a major barrier to retaining both attorney and other legal professional and community advocates in the immigrant legal services sector. As such, a salary analysis was conducted to help provide additional tools and knowledge for immigrant-serving organizations as they structure their existing teams and continue to hire new staff. De-identified administrative data used to conduct this analysis was gathered from the latest fiscal year budgets (FY24, July 1, 2023 – June 30, 2024) of 50 immigrant-serving organizations in the Illinois Access to Justice Network, with their permission.

Salary information was collected by organization and position, and subsequently organized by the following categories:

Job Category	Position titles were organized into 7 job categories under Immigration Legal Services and 4 job categories under Community Navigator services
Job Grouping	Immigration Legal services, Community Navigator services, Executive, or Administrative roles
Position Status	Part-time or Full-time
Geographic Region	Chicago Metro (comprising City of Chicago and Cook County), Collar Counties (comprising DuPage, Kane, Lake, McHenry, and Will Counties), or Outside of Cook & Collar Counties (comprising all other counties in Illinois. No further breakdown was included to maintain anonymity of organizational data).
Organizational Budget Size	Under \$2 Million; \$2 - \$5 Million; or Over \$5 Million

Only full-time, non-administrative, and non-executive positions were included in the salary analysis. The minimum, median, and maximum salaries were calculated by job category. Additionally, median salaries were cross-referenced with organizational size and location.





## **Immigration Legal Services Salary Information**

The tables below detail the minimum, median, and maximum salaries for each job category in immigration legal services. Each table shows how many organizations and positions were used to make the calculations.

## **Receptionist / Intake / Administrative Support**

As of July 2023	# Organizations	# Positions	Minimum	Median	Maximum
Overall	9	13	\$36,000	\$41,314	\$54,000
		Geograpi	nic Region		
Chicago Metro Area	6	8	\$36,421	\$41,314	\$54,000
Collar Counties	1	1	\$43,000	\$43,000	\$43,000
Outside Cook & Collar Counties	2	4	\$36,000	\$36,325	\$42,000
		Organization	al Budget Size		
Under \$2 Million	2	2	\$42,000	\$45,300	\$48,600
\$2-5 Million	4	6	\$36,000	\$41,200	\$54,000
Over \$5 Million	3	4	\$36,421	\$41,314	\$53,282

## **Paralegal / Legal Assistant**

As of July 2023	# Organizations	# Positions	Minimum	Median	Maximum
Overall	26	56	\$35,360	\$48,000	\$65,000
		Geograpi	hic Region		
Chicago Metro Area	18	40	\$37,577	\$48,000	\$65,000
<b>Collar Counties</b>	6	7	\$41,500	\$49,000	\$60,000
Outside Cook & Collar Counties	3	7	\$36,192	\$52,000	\$60,000
		Organization	al Budget Size		
Under \$2 Million	7	12	\$35,360	\$49,163	\$65,000
\$2-5 Million	11	17	\$36,192	\$46,000	\$61,000
Over \$5 Million	8	27	\$37,577	\$46,250	\$60,000





## **DOJ Accredited Representative**

As of July 2023	# Organizations	# Positions	Minimum	Median	Maximum
Overall	14	31	\$40,500	\$50,000	\$73,240
		Geograph	nic Region		
Chicago Metro Area	9	21	\$41,314	\$50,000	\$73,240
<b>Collar Counties</b>	3	5	\$40,500	\$46,000	\$58,000
Outside Cook & Collar Counties	2	5	\$45,000	\$49,870	\$58,000
		Organization	al Budget Size		
Under \$2 Million	5	6	\$40,500	\$50,250	\$58,000
\$2-5 Million	6	10	\$45,000	\$51,500	\$73,240
Over \$5 Million	5	15	\$41,314	\$49,065	\$66,515

### Attorney

As of July 2023	# Organizations	# Positions	Minimum	Median	Maximum
Overall	20	43	\$45,000	\$67,230	\$96,600
		Geograph	nic Region		
Chicago Metro Area	16	32	\$45,000	\$68,125	\$96,600
<b>Collar Counties</b>	2	5	\$61,000	\$63,000	\$80,000
Outside Cook & Collar Counties	2	6	\$60,500	\$64,654	\$76,063
		Organization	al Budget Size		
Under \$2 Million	7	11	\$60,500	\$70,000	\$85,000
\$2-5 Million	5	12	\$45,000	\$65,109	\$82,960
Over \$5 Million	8	20	\$55,100	\$66,277	\$96,600





## Managing / Supervising Attorney

As of July 2023	# Organizations	# Positions	Minimum	Median	Maximum
Overall	12	22	\$65,000	\$85,830	\$117,096
		Geograpi	hic Region		
Chicago Metro Area	8	16	\$65,000	\$85,830	\$109,800
<b>Collar Counties</b>	3	4	\$73,000	\$85,000	\$107,625
Outside Cook & Collar Counties	1	2	\$76,630	\$96,863	\$117,096
		Organization	al Budget Size		
Under \$2 Million	1	1	\$83,000	\$83,000	\$83,000
\$2-5 Million	6	9	\$65,000	\$77,000	\$117,096
Over \$5 Million	5	12	\$74,679	\$86,840	\$95,750

### **Legal Coordinator**

As of July 2023	# Organizations	# Positions	Minimum	Median	Maximum
Overall	10	19	\$32,240	\$53,115	\$75,135
		Geograph	nic Region		
Chicago Metro Area	7	15	\$42,000	\$53,115	\$75,135
<b>Collar Counties</b>	3	4	\$32,240	\$50,645	\$60,000
Outside Cook & Collar Counties	0	0	N/A	N/A	N/A
		Organization	al Budget Size		
Under \$2 Million	3	3	\$32,240	\$42,000	\$44,290
\$2-5 Million	5	7	\$43,000	\$54,000	\$60,000
Over \$5 Million	2	9	\$50,000	\$53,115	\$75,135

### **Legal Manager**

As of July 2023	# Organizations	# Positions	Minimum	Median	Maximum	
Overall	13	14	\$50,350	\$65,764	\$80,719	
		Geograpi	hic Region			
Chicago Metro Area	9	10	\$51,500	\$64,289	\$78,114	
<b>Collar Counties</b>	2	2	\$74,000	\$77,360	\$80,719	
Outside Cook & Collar Counties	2	2	\$50,350	\$60,175	\$70,000	
	Organizational Budget Size					
Under \$2 Million	2	2	\$55,000	\$62,500	\$70,000	
\$2-5 Million	5	5	\$50,350	\$74,000	\$80,719	
Over \$5 Million	6	7	\$51,500	\$64,578	\$78,114	





## **Legal Director**

As of July 2023	# Organizations	# Positions	Minimum	Median	Maximum
Overall	21	25	\$53,560	\$80,745	\$134,200
		Geograph	nic Region		
Chicago Metro Area	14	17	\$60,000	\$84,050	\$134,200
<b>Collar Counties</b>	4	4	\$53,560	\$72,625	\$95,000
Outside Cook & Collar Counties	3	4	\$64,000	\$74,000	\$84,091
		Organization	al Budget Size		
Under \$2 Million	7	8	\$53,560	\$74,000	\$88,000
\$2-5 Million	9	11	\$60,000	\$84,091	\$134,200
Over \$5 Million	5	6	\$77,615	\$90,865	\$125,296

## **Community Navigator Staff Salary Information**

The tables below detail the minimum, median, and maximum salaries for each job category in community navigator services. Each table shows how many organizations and positions were used to make the calculations.

### Coordinator

As of July 2023	# Organizations	# Positions	Minimum	Median	Maximum
Overall	14	20	\$26,448	\$41,600	\$48,431
		Geograph	nic Region		
Chicago Metro Area	7	11	\$26,448	\$41,847	\$48,000
Collar Counties	2	2	\$31,362	\$39,897	\$48,431
Outside Cook & Collar Counties	5	7	\$37,440	\$41,600	\$48,000
		Organization	al Budget Size		
Under \$2 Million	3	4	\$28,080	\$39,520	\$48,000
\$2-5 Million	7	10	\$26,448	\$42,300	\$48,431
Over \$5 Million	4	6	\$31,362	\$40,221	\$46,221





### Manager

As of July 2023	# Organizations	# Positions	Minimum	Median	Maximum
Overall	11	14	\$45,000	\$54,280	\$66,625
		Geograpł	nic Region		
Chicago Metro Area	4	6	\$49,640	\$55,000	\$58,425
Collar Counties	5	6	\$45,000	\$51,418	\$66,625
Outside Cook & Collar Counties	2	2	\$50,350	\$56,677	\$63,003
		Organization	al Budget Size		
Under \$2 Million	3	6	\$45,000	\$51,780	\$55,000
\$2-5 Million	7	7	\$48,000	\$55,000	\$66,625
Over \$5 Million	1	1	\$58,425	\$58,425	\$58,425

## Director

As of July 2023	# Organizations	# Positions	Minimum	Median	Maximum
Overall	12	12	\$49,920	\$74,271	\$96,886
		Geograph	nic Region		
Chicago Metro Area	6	6	\$68,000	\$74,000	\$90,927
<b>Collar Counties</b>	3	3	\$61,500	\$80,804	\$82,400
Outside Cook & Collar Counties	3	3	\$49,920	\$73,541	\$96,886
		Organization	al Budget Size		
Under \$2 Million	4	4	\$49,920	\$69,750	\$82,400
\$2-5 Million	5	5	\$73,000	\$75,000	\$96,886
Over \$5 Million	3	3	\$61,500	\$75,621	\$90,927

## Organizer

As of July 2023	# Organizations	# Positions	Minimum	Median	Maximum
Overall	8	12	\$37,400	\$49,418	\$117,350
		Geograph	nic Region		
Chicago Metro Area	7	11	\$37,400	\$49,955	\$117,350
<b>Collar Counties</b>	1	1	\$44,500	\$44,500	\$44,500
Outside Cook & Collar Counties	0	0	n/a	n/a	n/a
	Organizational Budget Size				
Under \$2 Million	2	5	\$37,400	\$40,000	\$60,000
\$2-5 Million	2	2	\$41,200	\$42,850	\$44,500
Over \$5 Million	4	5	\$48,880	\$54,750	\$117,350





### **SALARY ANALYSIS FINDINGS & CONSIDERATIONS**

#### Salary by Job Category

There is a considerable difference between the minimum and maximum pay ranges for each position, suggesting that several factors are used to determine salaries for staff in immigrant-serving organizations. In particular, the discrepancy between pay for DOJ Accredited Representatives and Attorneys is stark. While the median difference between paralegals and DOJ Accredited Representatives' salaries is \$2,000, the median difference between paralegals and attorneys is \$19,230, almost ten times more. Given the difficulty of recruiting and retaining bilingual attorneys, offering higher wages for DOJ Accredited Representatives that more accurately reflect the investment made in their education and training beyond what is expected of a paralegal could prove a useful strategy for recruitment and retention, while ensuring the organizations are increasing their capacity to provide immigration legal services.

Overall, organizations would benefit from offering competitive wages to recruit and retain staff, aiming towards the median and maximum range for each position. However, that is only a start, and there remains much structural work to do to make sure that all jobs in the immigrant services sector offer livable, competitive, and sustainable wages that are commensurate with the specialized knowledge and emotional labor required for staff to continue working in this field.

According to a 2020 American Bar Association Profile of the Legal Profession, "in general, [nationally] public service lawyers are paid far less than lawyers in other settings. For example, the median salary for a first-year lawyer working at a private law firm with 50 or fewer attorneys is about \$90,000. The median salary for a first-year public service lawyer is \$48,000 to \$58,300."

While beyond the scope of this analysis, in comparing the latest FY24 budgets with budgets from FY23 and FY22, there is data to show that some organizations are starting to increase staff salaries, and some are doing so significantly. Promising strategies include building in salary increases every year as budgets are renewed, as well as including mid-year merit increases. Continuing to raise the bar for salaries in the immigrant services sector will take creativity, long-term strategic planning, and working collaboratively with nonprofit executive leadership, boards, and funders.

#### Salary by Organizational Size & Geographic Region

Interestingly, salaries did not uniformly increase as organizational size increases, suggesting that other factors besides organizational budget determine salary structures. Additionally, there were not consistent patterns in terms of salary by geographic region. While Chicago metro area salaries are the highest in six out of the eleven job categories, there are numerous categories in which salaries are highest in the Collar Counties or counties outside of Cook and the collar counties.





### Potential Strategies for Improving Recruitment and Retention

To retain staff at immigrant-serving organizations across Illinois, funders and agencies should unite to address the main causes of turnover to create more sustainable long-term careers and help improve recruitment efforts. To address causes of turnover and help recruit staff to agencies, funders and agencies should focus their efforts on:

#### **Addressing Burnout**

- Adequately staff agencies to provide administrative assistance and reduce the number of hats worn by staff
- Provide support for staff that experience vicarious trauma from the emotionally distressing nature of the work
- Create more manageable workloads
- Promote work/life balance

### **Creating Growth Opportunities**

- Ensure career pathways are present and shared with staff
- Provide training opportunities (both hard and soft skills training)
- Create a pipeline for non-attorney staff to become legal representatives through training and the DOJ Recognition and Accreditation

#### **Funding Practices**

- Rather than developing grant applications that heavily weight number of opened cases, funders would benefit from creating a more expansive and comprehensive set of criteria that accurately reflect realistic outcomes from grantees
- Awarding general operating funds will greatly benefits sites' abilities to adequately staff, offer merit increases, and reach competitive salaries/benefits

#### Recruitment

- Efforts focused within the community such as seeking job candidates from the community the agency serves and building pipelines with various immigration organizations and schools
- Assess candidates' alignment with the organizational mission
- · Seek candidates that fit into the work culture
- Consider current and future positions and whether you can train and recruit from within through DOJ Recognition and Accreditation





## **Transforming Organizational Practices**

Our findings indicate that the personal characteristics of job candidates, such as their level of alignment with the organization's mission and the degree to which the workplace culture suits their needs, ultimately lead individuals to choose these jobs. Agencies can **examine their screening and interviewing processes to assess the extent to which they are currently probing for mission and culture alignment** to improve the likelihood of hiring new staff who will remain with the agency for the long-term.

We also find that recruitment is most fruitful when **jobs are promoted within the community** in which the agency is based. Additionally, networking by agency staff is an effective recruitment strategy that appears to improve outcomes. With respect to recruitment of attorneys, organizations can **work to build pipelines with law schools** in the region. Examples include building relationships with Career Services offices and reaching out to faculty to make staff available to present guest lectures on careers in immigrant legal services.

Our results suggest that agency staff appreciate the opportunity to hone their soft and hard skills. Employees reported that **having the opportunity for professional development and the ability to advance would keep them at their agencies**. These findings suggest that creating professional development opportunities can motivate staff to stay at their agencies. Some organizations nurtured a "grow your own" mentality and creatively developed career paths and advancement opportunities for staff, approaches that can be adopted by other agencies.

Given the relationship between burnout and turnover, **creating organizational cultures that prioritize staff wellness** may be a promising strategy. EDs can encourage work-life balance by modeling using vacation time and designing benefits packages that include adequate paid time off (both vacation and sick time). In some cases, **job descriptions may benefit from fresh eyes** in order to create more manageable workloads and expectations. Executive directors can **revisit how jobs are structured and consider whether rearranging responsibilities across roles** in more efficient ways may help create jobs that are more realistic for a single person to handle. Finally, workplace cultures that **emphasize support and communication between management and staff**, as well as between staff members, can also foster a work environment that helps agencies retain employees.





### **RECRUITMENT PRACTICES**

Recruitment of qualified individuals in this competitive landscape requires a creative and in-depth approach to hiring. Agencies may benefit from recruiting candidates that have a higher likelihood of success within the agencies by implementing to following practices:

- · Assessing candidates based on culture fit
- · Aligning with the mission and being dedicated to the work
- · Seeking job candidates from the community the agency serves
- Building pipelines with various immigration organizations and schools
- · See Additional Resources section for more information on recruitment practices

"Creating pipelines of attorneys who want to work in community-based non-profits, particularly bilingual/bicultural attorneys who come from the communities we serve, would be helpful. Also, we view increasing capacity through DOJ reps as an important investment in our community." - **Executive Director** 

### **RETENTION PRACTICES**

Agencies and EDs can retain staff better by implementing the following organizational practices that seek to address the main causes of turnover:

- Offering competitive wages/benefits and merit increases
- Planning for professional development and career path opportunities for staff in budget cycles
- Implementing organizational practices that may mitigate burnout among staff members
- Developing a mentorship program between experienced immigration legal representatives and newer attorneys or DOJ accredited reps

"A mentorship program between experienced immigration attorneys and new attorneys/DOJs could help build a stronger foundation for non-profits to create an immigration program or take on harder cases. This does create more work for the more experienced organizations, but if funding could be increased to orgs with more experienced staff, this could help." **– Executive Director** 





### **TRANSFORMING FUNDING PRACTICES**

**Funders play a critical role in immigrant legal services organizations' ability to improve retention.** By making grants that lack allocations for general operating funds, or restrict expenditures in this category, funders are directly responsible for creating the organizational conditions that lead to turnover. As a result, funders are in a position to significantly impact agencies' ability to retain staff and better serve immigrant families in their communities.

Without adequate general operating resources, agencies are unable to create high-quality jobs that staff will remain in over the long-term. Overhauled funding strategies that enable organizations to provide both competitive salaries and benefits as well as plan for merit increases are critically needed. Additionally, findings demonstrate that **burnout is often associated with requiring staff to handle an excess of cases and/or to cope with wearing many hats and being unable to focus on the core responsibilities of their roles.** Funders can provide more robust resources to reduce caseloads, and thus burnout, which will reduce turnover.

That said, current funding practices create an environment where executive directors may be hesitant to propose budgets that will enable them to offer high-quality jobs. By requesting funding levels that do not support competitive salaries and benefits, merit increases, adequate staffing levels, and resources for professional development, **EDs may be preventing funders from clearly understanding the financial implications of creating low-turnover work environments.** 

### **FUNDING STRATEGIES**

- Critically examining funding structures and implementing modifications that support reducing workloads and the number of cases assigned to staff members
  - Increase organization funding amounts to allow for yearly salary increases
  - Increase funder flexibility to trust organizations to understand the needs of the community
     and best way to respond
  - Allow for appropriate overhead expenses
- Providing adequate funding to support competitive wages and benefits, as well as merit increases; this includes general operating funds and multi-year grants
- Encouraging organizations and EDs to request fundings levels that support competitive salaries and benefits

"Uncertainty of grants, low pay and lack of benefits, often leave nonprofits relying on peer workers. While hearts are there, these peer workers lack the education and experience that is needed to truly be in the human services business. To retain our well educated and experienced staff, nonprofits need higher pay, benefits and long-term funding." **- Executive Director** 





## Appendices

### **Appendix A: References**

American Bar Association (2020). ABA Profile of the Legal Profession. <u>https://www.americanbar.org/content/dam/aba/administrative/news/2020/07/potlp2020.pdf</u>

Burka, M. (2023). Employee Voice Survey Results: WORC+TRP Findings Conference. The Resurrection Project.

Table 1A. Immigration Legal Services Job Categories and Titles Used in Salary Analysis

Table 1B. Community Navigator Services Job Categories and Titles Used in Salary Analysis

Frank-Miller, E. (2023). Creating Quality Jobs in Legal Services and Community Navigator Programs: Recruitment, Retention, and Reducing Turnover. Presentation at the 3rd Annual Access to Justice Summit, Malcom X College, Chicago, IL. Workforce & Organizational Research Center.

The Resurrection Project. (n.d.). Immigration Legal Services. <u>https://resurrectionproject.org/immigration-legal-services/</u>





### Appendix B: Overview of Positions Included in Salary Analysis

Job Category	# Organizations	# Positions	Titles Included
Receptionist / Intake / Admin Support	9	13	Intake Specialist, Lead Intake Specialist, Senior Intake Specialist, Intake Coordinator, Receptionist, Program Associate, Reporting Administrative
Paralegal / Legal Assistant	26	56	Legal Assistant, Paralegal, Law Clerk, Legal Clerk, Paralegal and Referrals Coordinator, Senior Paralegal, Immigration Practice Assistant, Paralegal / Accredited Rep Trainee, Immigration Legal Assistant, Case Worker, Community Support Lead
DOJ Accredited Representative	15	31	DOJ Accredited Representative, Legal Representative, Immigration Specialist, Immigration Services Counselor, Immigration Caseworker, DOJ Partially Accredited Representative, DOJ Fully Accredited Representative, Senior DOJ Accredited Representative
Attorney	19	43	Attorney, Staff Attorney, Senior Staff Attorney, Immigration Attorney, Immigration Lawyer, Immigration Staff Attorney
Managing / Supervising Attorney	12	22	Managing Attorney, Supervisory Attorney, Senior Attorney Supervisor, Senior Supervising Attorney, Supervising Staff Attorney, Supervising Attorney
Coordinator	9	19	Outreach Coordinator, Legal Clinic Coordinator, Immigration & Outreach Coordinator, Pro Bono Coordinator, Program Coordinator, Support Services Coordinator, Clinic Coordinator, Coordinator, Legal Coordinator
Manager	13	14	Program Manager, Legal Services Manager, Immigration Services Manager, Pro Bono Manager, Legal Supervisor, Assistant Director, Community Empowerment Supervisor, Immigration Department Manager, Immigration Program Manager, Legal Services Manager, Legal Supervisor
Director	21	25	Deputy Director, Program Director, Director of Legal Services, Associate Director, Co- Director, Director of Immigration, Director of Immigration Practice, Director of Programs, Immigration Program Director, legal Director, Managing Director, Program Director

### Table 1A. Immigration Legal Services Job Categories & Titles Used in Salary Analysis





### Table 1B. Community Navigator Services Job Categories and Titles Used in Salary Analysis

Job Category	# Organizations	# Positions	Titles Included
Coordinator	14	20	Program Coordinator, Community Navigator Coordinator, Project Coordinator, Community Engagement Coordinator, Health Program Coordinator, Immigration & Outreach Coordinator, Case Manager, Immigrant Family Services Coordinator, Immigrant Services Coordinator, Lead Promoter, Navigation Coordinator, Navigator Program Coordinator, Office/Program Coordinator, Outreach & Volunteer Coordinator, Super Navigator, Super Navigator in Chief
Manager	11	14	Program Manager, Community Navigator Manager, Outreach Manager, Case Manager, Immigrant Services Manager, Program Supervisor, Community Outreach and Education Supervisor, Community Outreach Manager, Community Resources Program Manager, Immigrant Family Services Manager
Director	12	12	Community Outreach Director, Associate Director, Project Director, Program Director, Community Engagement Director, Director of Immigration Services, Social Services Director, Assistant Director of Programs, CN Director, Director of Immigrant Programs, Project Director, Social Services Director
Organizer	8	12	Community Navigator, Lead Community Navigator, Organizer, Legal Organizer, Community Organizer, Immigration Organizer, Senior Organizer, Digital Organizer, Outreach and Engagement Organizer





#### **Appendix C: Resources for Additional Learning**

**The Job Quality Maps**, developed by WORC in partnership with the National Fund for Workforce Solutions with generous support from the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation, helps employers design better jobs for business impact by mapping desired employer outcomes to specific jobs.



### **Good Jobs: A Working Definition**

#### **Economic Stability**

- Stable, family-sustaining pay
- Sufficient, accessible, and broadly available benefits
- Fair, reliable scheduling practices
- Safe, healthy, and accessible working conditions

#### **Economic Mobility**

- Clear and equitable hiring and advancement pathways
- Accessible, paid training and development opportunities
- Wealth-building opportunities





#### Equity, Respect & Voice

- Organizational and management culture, policies, and practices that:
  - are transparent and enable accountability
  - support a sense of belonging and purpose
  - advance DEIA\*
  - and address discrimination.
- Ability to improve the workplace, such as through collective action or participatory management practices

\*DEIA: diversity, equity, inclusion, and accessibility







MEANINGFULNESS Work itself and significance to customer PERSONAL GROWTH Learning, creativity, problem solving

BELONGING Team, pride for working at the company, mutual respect

ACHIEVEMENT Have autonomy, tools, time and resources to do great work RECOGNITION High expectations, feedback from others and job

### WORK PROVIDES BASIC NEEDS

PAY & BENEFITS Fair for the work and compared to others, meets needs SCHEDULES Stable and predictable schedules, adequate hours CAREER PATH Clear and fair advancement to higher pay SECURITY & SAFETY Keep job if perform well, safe conditions







#### **DOL - Good Jobs Initiative**

DOL – Good Jobs Initiative is an initiative that provides critical information to workers, employers, and government agencies as they work to improve job quality and create access to good jobs free from discrimination and harassment for all working people.

**The Management Center** provides coaching, training, and resources to strengthen social justice organizations, including this article on making compensation more equitable.

**TRP's Immigrant Justice Leadership Academy, Colibrí Fellowship** - the first of its kind professional fellowship for individuals seeking partial or full Department of Justice (DOJ) Accreditation. The Fellowship's goal is to train future non-attorney legal representatives to strengthen the capacity of community-based legal aid organizations.

#### **SHRM Screening and Evaluating Job Candidates**







